



“Deskilling and Disempowerment” of skilled Eritrean and Ethiopian migrant women in the Netherlands

A Research Paper presented by:

Genet Haile Getachew
(Eritrea)

in partial fulfilment of the requirements for obtaining the degree of
MASTERS OF ARTS IN DEVELOPMENT STUDIES

Specialization:

Women, Gender and Development
(WGD)

Members of the Examining Committee:

Dr. Karin Astrid Siegmann [Supervisor]

Dr. Nahda Shehada [Reader]

The Hague, The Netherlands
December 2012

Disclaimer:

This document represents part of the author's study programme while at the Institute of Social Studies. The views stated therein are those of the author and not necessarily those of the Institute.

Inquiries:

Postal address:

Institute of Social Studies
P.O. Box 29776
2502 LT The Hague
The Netherlands

Location:

Kortenaerkade 12
2518 AX The Hague
The Netherlands

Telephone: +31 70 426 0460

Fax: +31 70 426 0799

Contents

<i>List of Tables</i>	<i>v</i>
<i>List of Appendices</i>	<i>v</i>
<i>List of Acronyms</i>	<i>vi</i>
<i>Abstract</i>	<i>viii</i>
Chapter 1 : Introduction, Indicating the Research Problem and Research Question	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2. Statement of the Problem	2
1.3. Research Objective and Research Question	3
1.4. Research Relevance	3
1.5 Limitations of this Study	4
Chapter 2 : Literature Review and Conceptual Frame Work Analysis	5
2.1 Introduction	5
2.2 Characteristics of Labor Market and Feminist Perspective	5
2.3 Discourses surrounding Skill	6
2.4 Attributed Reasons for Deskillling	7
2.5 Conceptualizing Empowerment and Disempowerment	8
2.5.1 Skill and Deskillling in relation to Empowerment and Disempowerment	10
2.5.2 Experience of Deskillling, Coping Mechanism to deal with Deskillling and (Dis) empowerment	10
Chapter 3 : Research Methodology and Method	12
3.1 Methodology	12
3.2.1 Sampling Technique	12
3.2.2 Interview	13
3.2 Desk Review	13
3.3 Data Analysis	13
3.4 Ethical Consideration	14
3.5 Reflection	14
Chapter 4 : Underlying Causes for Inability to Apply Human Capital in the Labor Market	16
4.1 Introduction	16
4.2 Socio Economic Background	16
4.3 Process of Deskillling and Disempowerment	16

4.4	Underlying Causes for inability to apply Human Capital in the Labor Market	19
4.4.1	Lack of Social Network	19
4.4.2	Unrecognizing Foreign Credentials	22
4.4.3	Dutch Language Proficiency cited as Problem	24
4.4.4	The Presence of Intersecting Identity and Intersectional Discrimination	26
Chapter 5 : Experience of Deskilling and Existing Mechanisms Dealing with Deskilling		30
5.1	Introduction	30
5.2	Experience of Deskilling and migrants agency	30
5.3	Coping Mechanism to deal with Process of Deskilling	31
Chapter 6 : Conclusion and Recommendation		35
6.1	Introduction	35
6.2	Conclusion and Recommendation	35
Appendices		37
References		38

List of Tables

Table 1.1 Research Participants	18
---------------------------------------	----

List of Appendices

Appendix 1: Interview Guidelines	37
----------------------------------	----

List of Acronyms

B.A:	Bachelor Degree
CV:	Curriculum Vita
CBS:	Central Bureau of Statistics
ISS:	Institute of Social Studies
NGO:	Non Governmental Organization
MA:	Master of Arts

Acknowledgment

First I would like to thank the World Bank for giving me this great opportunity to pursue my higher education. My deepest gratitude extends to ISS for giving me this chance to be part of this prestigious institution.

My genuine gratitude goes to my supervisor Karin Astrid Siegmann, who equipped me with valuable suggestion and supervised me with earnest professionalism. Karin also deserves special thanks for treating me with greater humanity and motivating approach right from the inception up to the end of this research paper.

It takes me immense pleasure to thank my second reader Nahda Shehada, who is credited for cementing the concept of intersectionality in my academic career and for providing me valuable comments for this research.

I thank respondents of this research from Eritrea and Ethiopia, especially Haimanot and Goitom Ghebrai for helping me in getting the interviewee

My gratitude goes to my beloved father Haile Getachew for his unending love and generous in most trying times. I am thankful to my Mother Awotash for being supportive and showing me love.

My stay in ISS was marred by difficulties especially, in relation to my father's illness, but I overcome it due to the following friends, Yvette, Biniyam Afe-worki and Elelta who helped me in prayer and emotional support by saying "you will do it". The contribution of Martin Block was greatly important when he helped me in arranging my ticket to go and visit my father and I deeply thank him for that.

My deepest gratitude extended to each of you Kisanet, Eden, Tarik and Kidist for making me fresh in all my stay in ISS.

Abstract

This research examines labor market experience of skilled Eritrean and Ethiopian migrant women using qualitative research method. Empirical studies on deskilling of migrant women argue deskilling caused due to labor market structural barriers. Based on the key finding the research is arguing deskilling as having far reaching consequence, which is disempowerment. Focusing on skilled Eritrean and Ethiopian migrant women labor market experience in reference to deskilling clues, how women empowered identity at risk in host country labor market. Skilled migrant women situated in contradictory situation both with pre-migration empowered and post migration disempowered identity. Accordingly, skilled Eritrean and Ethiopian migrant women identified the presence of structural barriers in the labor market. The lack of access to employment proportionate with their skill are due to, lack of social network, unrecognizing foreign credentials, assumed they lack language skills, the presence of intersecting identities and dominant discourse that depicts migrant women as unskilled. The data is analyzed using Naila Kabeer's notion of (dis)empowerment by emphasizing on "choice", which is realized through access to resource and exercise of agency. The finding indicates dealing with deskilling and mechanism to deal with deskilling as perpetuating relative disempowerment. This research points to the presence of skilled migrant women with in the seemingly homogenous category of unskilled migrant women who are systematically discouraged from the labor market. Hence, the need to pay attention to the heterogeneity of migrant women with in the policy making.

Relevance to Development Studies

There is a general consensus that woman empowerment is an important root to exercise choices, over available resource at hand with greater autonomy. Nevertheless, in migration regime women, empowerment remains subject to disempowerment through deskilling. Growing literature and empirical studies suggested, most of the impediments are stemmed from homogenizing attitude towards heterogeneous identities. For this reason, development studies specifically, women and gender are too critical to such dominant discourses, for its generalization for diverse experience, that considers vast women experience as a single unified category. Hence, development studies emphasizes, in order such homogenization and discourse to be altered the need to make an extensive study through qualitative method and intersectionality found to be an effective response to the dilemma. In this regard, this study will be relevant as it highlights gender, race and class specific concerns and constraints of migrant women through the lens of intersectionality in its narratives.

Keywords

Skilled migrant, Deskilling, Labor-market, Empowerment, Disempowerment, Eritrean, Ethiopian and intersectionality

Chapter 1 : Introduction, Indicating the Research Problem and Research Question

1.1 Introduction

Empowerment is largely emphasized concept in development discourse and recommended popular unquestioned 'good' for women (Deere and De Leal 2001). Within the aforementioned idea education is found to be the way to empower and liberate women from established suppression. Through, the acquired education, women translate their self-worth and agency by participating in the labor market (Kabeer 2009). Labor participation of women is viewed as important enhancing way to expand women's access to resource, to realize sense of choice, self-actualization and empowerment (Ibid). Despite this understanding and benefit of empowerment as valuable asset, it remains at risk in relation to skilled migrant women. Empowerment fails to continue in developed world labor market system, women empowered status tends to be threatened through deskilling in migration. To work in low skilled job or permanently to withdraw from the labor market is becoming a lived reality for migrants who have qualified skills. According to Wren and Boyle (2001:40) description of deskilling is, "it is a down ward mobility and potential loss of skill due to failure to recognize, skills and qualifications gained during previous educational and professional background." In relation to skilled women the downward mobility explained in different terms, Ho 2006, Man2004, Suto2009, Yeoh and Wills 2005 (as cited in Meares 2010:476) described the transition as "feminization, deskilling, compromised careers and re-domestication" respectively.

The circumstance which captures the concern of this study is the situation of skilled Eritrean and Ethiopian migrants in Dutch labor market system. The crucial source of understanding to the situation of skilled Eritrean and Ethiopian migrant women is my Eritrean background. This gave me the chance to observe the migrant's engagement in low skill jobs. Regarding Eritrean and Ethiopian migrant people in Dutch labor market there is a relative dearth of adequate information. Diverse migration studies focuses on experiences of earlier migrants that are Turks, Moroccan and Surinam's socio-economic disadvantage position in the labor market. Despite their number is on increase, the situation of Sub-Saharan African migration into the country has never been a main focus of research in main-stream migration study and policy frame" (Guiraudon et al. 2005:76 and Hamer 2008: 348). The aforementioned gap in focus is mainly stem from generalization attitude towards migrant women. For instance, Dutch emancipation policy which is designed to address migrant women integration to the society largely focuses Turks, Surinam and Moroccans integration and their challenge in the labor market. To support this claim Korteweg (2005:12) who analysed the Dutch emancipation policy pointed out that "regardless of their difference in background, Dutch emancipation policy struggled with the assumption of women as internally, as the same and coherent group." Moreover the same policy also assumes migrant women from all group experience problem in the same way and (ibid).

Nevertheless, the Netherlands Central Bureau of Statistic (CBS) (2005) provides a glimpse of information regarding these two ethnic groups. Eritrean and Ethiopian migrants came to the Netherlands in search of better economic opportunity, to join family members, or as an asylum seeker and refugees. CBS (2005:3) “report indicates, there are 10.292 Eritrean and Ethiopian migrants, out of this 4.717 (46%) are females, including first and second generation migrants. In relation to the labor-market participation, the report added that, labor involvement of African migrant in general as not encouraging; unemployment is high and numerous works below their education level.”

According to Institute of Applied Social Science, study on new five ethnic groups (Afghans, Ethiopian, Eritrean, Somali and Vietnamese) who have legal residence permit said, Ethiopian/Eritrean fled to the Netherlands before 1992 (Instituut voor Toegepaste Sociale Wetenschappen 2000). These two groups resided in the Netherlands fairly for long periods and majority arrived as single individual, (not as a family member) the same source added that, ‘educational back grounds of these two groups are fairly enrolled in higher professional or university-level’ (ibid: 21). Therefore, taking the aforesaid glimpse of information as a point of reference, to research on labor market experience of skilled Eritrean and Ethiopian migrant women will pave the way to view the larger situation of Sub-Saharan African migrants and triggers for further research and to craft inclusive policy.

1.2. Statement of the Problem

Using two Dutch labor force survey reports, Hartog and Zorlu (2008) documented the noticeable difference in labor participation of migrant people from the local population. The same source adds, migrant labor market difficulties is not only restricted to access to employment. It goes further to the segmentation of the employment that is concentration, in particular jobs, occupation with poor job quality, low earning and limited upward mobility (ibid). Different empirical researches regarding labor market experience of skilled and non skilled migrant women in the Netherlands highlighted the presence of discrimination based on ethnicity, race, and gender in accessing the employment opportunity (Korteweg 2005, Ghorashi and Tilburg 2006). Indeed, human capital and language skills among other things are considered as main element to integrate to the Dutch labor market (Korteweg 2005). However, Ghorashi and Tilburg (2006) who researched the labor market experience of skilled Afghan and Iranian migrant women identifies the presence of deskilling in Dutch labor market due to unrecognized foreign credentials and language inability.

In addition to this although, migrants are discriminated based on the multiplicity of identity, migrants also undergo homogenization problematic definition both regardless of, their difference in experience e.g. race, ethnicity gender and class and also in framing them as unskilled (Korteweg 2005, Roggeband and Verloo 2007). For instance, Roggeband and Verloo (2007: 287) explanation of the policy document issued from 1995 to 2005 depicted migrant women as a ‘growing problem that lags behind in the participation of the labor market.’ However, the policy lacks to mention which categories of migrant women are growing problem and unable to figure out what happen at the end

of labor market participation (ibid). This problematic view, potentially impacted their ability to look for job with greater flexibility, as their identity is solidly constructed beforehand. In explaining the problem of this discourse in reference to Dutch labor market Ghorashi and Tilburg (2006:65) pointed out “though, organizations and employers have their own systems and dynamics to hire an individual, certainly they are also influenced by the wider surrounding situation in which they are function.” Thus, it is almost impossible to imagine that the power of dominant discourses on migrant women in Dutch society could not affect job opportunities (ibid). Given the aforesaid combinations of impediments, skilled Eritrean and Ethiopian migrant women caught at two challenging points. This research place two possible hypotheses for the origin of the challenges; at one extreme, they are unable to invest their human capital due to the above mentioned barriers which may lead them to deskilling, on the other side if deskilling is apparent the situation may threaten their empowered identity.

1.3. Research Objective and Research Question

This research aims at examining the process and challenges faced by skilled Eritrean and Ethiopian migrant in accessing the Dutch labor market at relevant skill. In this regard the main research questions are, what are the challenges faced by skilled women from Eritrea and Ethiopia in the labor market? And how those challenges affect their empowered identity and effectively lead them to disempowerment.

Research Sub questions

- What are the reasons for skilled Eritrean and Ethiopian migrant women not to use their skill in the Dutch labor market?
- To what extent does intersecting identities and homogenization interpretation play a role in facilitating and hindering job finding?
- How do skilled Eritrean and Ethiopian migrants experience labor market challenges?
- What are the coping mechanisms migrant’s used to deal with labor market challenges? And how it impacted their empowered identity?

1.4. Research Relevance

Research relevance is two-fold

1. Iredale (2001:1) expresses the current literature on skilled migrant [women] is by and large far from explaining what is happening at the end of labor market spectrum in host country. In general, various potential reasons are forwarded for this gap. Erel (2007) said in most migration literature, the presence of skilled women is largely ignored; much emphasis was given to male and their problem in the labor market. This is mainly due the dominant depictions of migrant women in a host country overshadowed by the image of un-skilled category and women enters to host country as family dependent (Kofman 2000). This has made difficult to notice the presence of skilled women in mi-

gration (ibid). Not different from the aforesaid idea, in the Netherlands some literatures document the presence of deskilling among migrant women (Ghorashi and Tilburg 2006). Despite the recognition of deskilling among migrants, little is researched about the root causes and its far-reaching consequence to entire skilled migrant.

2. There is common understanding, regardless of the type of job they occupy; it is widely believed that migration provides convenient opportunity for women to participate in the labor market to gain empowerment (Morokvašić 1984 and Park 2008). Nevertheless, having access to labor market cannot be justified as empowerment; such empowerment must be questioned in terms of, which categories of women (skilled, unskilled) are accessing the labor market and at what expense? Till recently, migrant women involvement in the labor market was seen as a source of empowerment with quantitative analysis. Limited qualitative study has been given to the type of job they occupy and how job opportunity is influenced by gender, race and migration status. Moreover, deskilling as a phenomenon in the context of (dis)empowerment and has also little researched in migration literature. Thus, to research the situation of skilled Eritrean and Ethiopian migrant women from the lenses of (dis)empowerment and intersectionality is significant, to see the presence of various identities and how empowerment is subject to constraints in migration. Thus, by researching skilled Eritrean and Ethiopian migrant's labor market challenges this research tries to address these information gaps.

1.5 Limitations of this Study

This research is carried out in small sample size, in this sense; the issue of representativeness of the finding may come out as a relevant question to arrive at sound conclusion/generalization. However, the in-depth interview which exposed their personal narration from different angle taken as a relevant source of credible information to investigate the reality on the ground. As, "the truths revealed from real positions in the world, through lived experience in social relationships are valid in their own right and thus are respected in their integrity." (James 2010:26). Furthermore, this research does not include the Netherlands overall market economy and employment and unemployment rate. Indeed, to investigate rate of employment and unemployment is important, as it have considerable influence in employment opportunity on its own right. However for the sake of this research I focused on migrant women related problems, to highlight the labor market dynamics in relation to women.

Chapter 2 : Literature Review and Conceptual Frame Work Analysis

2.1 Introduction

This chapter presents theoretically supported potential reasons for deskilling. The chapter uncovers characteristics of labor markets from feminist perspective, construction of skill, deskilling and job searching mechanism. All these mentioned subtitles, provide how and why deskilling apparent in the labor market for women especially for migrant women. Moreover, this chapter conceptualizes the notion of empowerment and disempowerment in relation to skill and deskilling context. The last section of this chapter deals with experience of deskilling and mechanism to deal with it. The conceptual background idea explicitly stemmed from Naila Kabeer's (1999) (dis)empowerment notions and contextualized in a way how skilled migrants are disempowered in host country labor market through deskilling.

2.2 Characteristics of Labor Market and Feminist Perspective

Indeed various jobs searching mechanism influences the ability to access the labor market, but labor market by itself is not smooth place for every social category for instance for women and minorities. Though, "economist described it in a simplest term labor market is a free and neutral place, where buyers and sellers intermingle" (Elson 1999:612). Practically, labor market is embedded with power imbalance between different actors, and it is widely influenced and governed by invisible hands that are influenced in assumptions and interests. Within the mentioned discursive assumption, discursive understandings of multiple identities become central and institutionalized through segregation and segmentation (McDowell 2008). For example in explaining employment segmentation theory Reich et al. (1973: 359) put forward, "in the labor market there is wide spread and deep-rooted division of labor based on individual specific identity for example, race, gender, education and class." These segmented groups appear to work in distinctive labor markets, with different occupational conditions, promotional opportunities, wages and different market and institutions (ibid). Feminist labor market characteristics explanation is not far from the aforesaid position; it mainly associated with the asymmetric power relation dynamics of heteronormativity; heterosexual matrix regulates social relations in the workplace, and principles of heteronormativity rules guide every day collective practices (McDowell (2008). In labor market specific identities constructed and maintained to ensure the continuity of the heterosexual matrix as a dominant and legitimate notion to explain labor division, heteronormativity principles and guideline played significant role in shaping and influencing vast heterogeneous social reality (ibid). The power imbalance prevailed in the labor market is sustained and maintained through the institutionalized laws and regulations against marginalized groups. Institutions produce measurements assuming andro-centric model of construction, which means not gender neutral. For example, Andersson (2005) and Guo (2006) as

cited Creese and Wiebe (2009:60) put forward that “academic or professional credential recognition by itself is a political procedure that replicates the existing asymmetric power relations inside the labor market.” In explaining the structural barriers skilled migrant women encountered instead, of direct entry into the labor-market Men (2004) and Purkayastha (2005) pointed out that their entry is hindered due to racialised institutional procedures in the form of accreditation system which demands the host countries spirit of labor experience. These kinds of influenced institutional act combined with employers action tends to facilitate either deskilling or to absolute exclusion from the labor market. Thus, in response to these collective exclusion migrant people accorded the lowest employment hierarchy, or in the worst case, they will be totally invisible from the labor market (McDowell 2004). Within this ladder, in addition to the inherent gender disadvantageous category, women as migrant their position will be placed apparently in the lowest strata. The other problematic characteristics, which has significant influence to the labor market is the policy. The policy which is influenced by homogenization assumption originated from identity construction due to power dominance. As Mohanty (1998:65) said, “third world women are categorized as a single monolithic category”, migrant’s also depicted in host country the same and categorized as “unskilled.” Similarly, feminist scholars insists this categorical understanding of migrant women identity as stem from “the ‘colonial gaze, that migrants form third world constructed as other, backward, and non-modern in comparison with western modernity, and this marker of difference continue to operate in developed world labor market system” (Bhabha 1994, McClintock 1995, Spivak 1999 and Young 1995 as cited in McDowell 2008:499).

2.3 Discourses surrounding Skill

As continuation of the above mentioned asymmetric power relation in the labor market the notion of skill is also differently constructed when it is possessed by women or any other powerless group. Prior to explaining the experience of de-skilling it is important to uncover some literatures to explain skill from theoretical perspective and ideological construction. The concept of skill is controversial notion and subject to social construction in the realm of social science, like any other common sense notions, skill reflects complex and ambiguous idea (Attewell 1990). Various researches and school of thought made an attempt to explain skill. Positivism approach which is largely influenced by quantitative assumption emphasizes skill as gained from education, job experience and determined by complexity of its activity, and it has clear measurement (ibid). Moreover, mainstream economies and proponent of this theory also see skill as a quality of jobs rather than persons (Esposto 2008). Critique of this approach asserts that “mainstream accounts of skills fails to recognize the complexity of skill and puts too much emphasize on generalization and failed to deal with the subjective dimensions that affect assumptions, definitions and skill measurements” (Esposto 2008 and Holman 2000:960).

As opposed to the positivist approach explanation to skill, ethno-methodological school of thought asserts every activity even the ordinary and human capacities are not just a matter of reason, intelligence, or knowledge but are unconscious and exactly personified (Attewell 1990). The Webrian School

of thought which is influenced by the concept of class clarifies “occupations are socially demarcated as class the process some come to dominate higher position than others’ and to maintain the demarcated grip over the labor market and introduced various mechanisms, starting from introducing prolonged training to greater emphasis on credentialism” (Esposto 2008:102). In explaining the Marxian version of skill presentation, Attewell (1990) asserts ‘skill as a commonsense category which does not need explanation.’ From all the given explanation skill is differently constructed as socially contingent and gendered concept (Figart 1997). To substantiate this claim Jenkins (2004) pointed out the notion of skill as perfectly socially constructed and crafted to serve the androcentric interest and valued in a different way, based on, how and where it is obtained. Similar to this claim Kofman and Raghuram (2005) also suggests that the concept of skill per se as not free from gender bias and within this context, the type of work which women perform often claimed as less skilled.

2.4 Attributed Reasons for Deskilling

Based on empirical studies different causes are forwarded for the deskilling of migrant people especially for migrant women. Various, theoretically supported thoughts particularly, from the economics domain explanation of the labor market, asserts, deskilling of migrant women occurs due to reasons they lack language skill, human capital, and background culture, among other things (McGovern 2007). For instance, human capital theory suggests women’s low investment in their human capital as a potential reason for occupational segregation in the labor market (ibid). Nevertheless, this narrow emphasis on skill is challenged by migrant women who work below their skill level in host country labor market due to structural barriers (Miller in Syed 2008)¹. Although, their skilled suppose, to provide them suitable occupation, however in contrast to human capital theory claim, skilled migrant are found to be in challenging situation. The potential barrier that channelled skilled migrant women to engage in a job which is not proportionate with their academic and work experience records is totally overlooked by mainstream labor market analysts (Creese and Wiebe (2009).

Differently, from the abovementioned claims, that migrants are deskilled due to the presence of barriers. However, considerable scholars argues, that migrants way of job searching method and behaviors as having significant influence in getting job opportunity or deskilling. Three types of job searching methods are known to have impact in accessing the labor market these are informal/social networking, formal and through direct application (Beggs and Hurlbert 1997; Granovetter 1974 in Huffman and Torres 2001:128). The pronounced job searching method which has wider influence in getting job opportunity is social networking. Social network has important function for the employer and job seeker for good reasons. “Employer prefer social networking to save advertisement and recruitment cost and also feel they are hiring a known

¹ Structural barriers signify a barrier that is presented in the labor market in the form of language inability and unrecognizing foreign credentials for migrant people. The term structural barriers are explicitly used in migration literature especially in relation to deskilling.

quantity, which means from the same group” (McGovern 2007:227). And from the employee side social networking may reduce significantly the overall length of job searching time, and it also guarantee the existence of the network to successive cohort (Huffman and Torres 2001 and McGovern 2007). According to Licher and Waldinger (2003) (as cited in McGovern 2007:227) suggestion, although, normally employers prefers to hire jobs to the outstanding workers, however the best workers are not selected simply on the basis of skill and work experience, employers select those from the top ranked group first and the rest follow according to their racial or ethnic position in the wider society (ibid). Furthermore, Social networking as part of the informal way of accessing the labor market has significant influence in labor market outcome. Social networking has a potential to produce exclusion for certain groups by restricting job information in favour of particular ethnic groups who have already grip with the work setting (McGovern 2007).

As, this study is much more focused on women, it is important for this research to see role of social network from gender perspective. According to Huffman and Torres (2001) explanation, social network exhibits gendered behaviour. Social networking as dominant instrument in accessing employment produces different employment outcomes for both male and female in the labor market. The same source adds women as compare to man have less social network due to less power and influence, which has potential cause to occupational gender segregation in the labor market (Ibaraa 1992 as cited in Huffman and Torres 2001). Considering the power imbalance in the labor market, Ibaraa’s idea is greatly convincing to accept, that woman has less social connection as compared to men. In this sense some scholars argues, the formal way of job searching has more advantage for female than male job seekers. This is because formal methods are more public and accessible to everyone, which has visible effect and produces employment opportunity for women and other disadvantageous group who are unable to access it via social networking (Drentea 1998).

2.5 Conceptualizing Empowerment and Disempowerment

The concept of empowerment has interpreted in multiplicity of ways and in context specific terms in various disciplines. For instance empowerment for social advocate is an instrument planned to motivate the disadvantaged group to challenge the existing subordination, while for business and managers empowerment is a means to enhance efficiency within established structures (Parpart et al. 2002). However, in its broader definition “empowerment is the process of enhancing an individual’s or group’s capacity to make effective choices, then to transform those meaning full choices into desired actions and outcomes” (Alsop et al. 2006 as cited in Samman and Santos 2009:3). The main reason to remain empowerment vague and context specific is due to its logical association with sensitivity of ‘power’ a power, which is abstract and operates at an overt and covert level. To conceptualize empowerment, it is significant to discuss the notion of ‘power’ since “power is central to any conceptualizations of empowerment and is at the very root of the term itself” (Sardenberg 2008:19).

Various scholars argue that power is the ability to control over available resources and institutions. Similarly, Parpart et al. (2002:5) also said, “power also controls individual thinking and plan by mystifying crucial issues and influencing people to accept the existing rules and orders as natural and fixed.” In the long run this kind of influence translates to internalize the system, which are expressed in thoughts and discourses by oppressive practice (ibid). Within the context of power, one method to thinking concerning power is, in terms of the ability to make choices (Syed 2010). To exercise such choices, shift in balance of power will be important in favour of those who were not able to make choice and unable to change the rules and regulation that believed to be unchanged. Thus, this process of changing unequal power relationship in favour of those who were powerless refers to empowerment (Kabeer 1999).

According to Kabeer (1999:436) “empowerment is defined as the ability to make strategic life choices and disempowerment is to deny those strategic life choices.” In border context choice implies the possibility of alternatives, the ability to have chosen otherwise.” (ibid: 437). To conceptualize empowerment three interconnected dimensions are significant, these are resource, agency and achievements. Resource is accessed through multitude social relations carried out in a variety of institutional realm, which make up the family, community and markets. Resources also take the form of genuine allocation, future expectations and claims” (ibid: 437). However, not every social category are entitled to access the resources, some groups are denied by virtue of their position in wider social structure. Allocation of resource is subject to constraints due to the norms and rules that describes social relation among different social categories. These “norms and means place some over another through dominance and differentiate the choices available to each groups in relation to access and control over resources” (Flore 1994 as cited in Kabeer 2009:7). In sum, accesses to resource through available choice are one way of ensuring empowerment of disadvantaged group (ibid).

The second dimension Kabeer (1999) mentioned agency is the ability to define one’s goal through strategic life choice and act upon them through meaningful bargaining and negotiating in important life matters. Strategic life choice implies, for decisions that made by an individual which has significant influence in the course of life, for instance, in marriage, education and employment opportunities Narayan-Parker (2005). Agency is more than observable action; it includes sense of “power within” and can manifest in positive and negative sense of power (Kabeer 1999). Positive sense of agency indicates individual ability to identify their own life choices and to pursue their own goals, while, negative sense of power is exercised through the “power over” to undermine the agency of others by oppression (ibid:438). In supporting the above mentioned claim of negative sense of agency Alsop et al. (2006) (in Ibrahim and Alkire 2007:385) mentioned agency of an [individual or people] can be encouraged and discouraged by the surrounding environment in which people live. Surrounding environment signifies, the institutional, the social and political climate (ibid). The third way of exercising choice is achievement and it is the sum of resource and agency. This dimension is much more related with the presence of basic inequalities in people’s ability to make choice and such inequalities indicate the operation of explicit power intrusion by other (Kabeer 1999). This kind of power manifested either as “absence of choice for

one group as subordinate or as active discrimination by other dominant group” (ibid: 440). Eventually this power domination creates internalization of certain circumstances as unchanged and may significantly affect the well being of the individual and significant other’s wellbeing. Thus the interconnected of these three pillars of dimension ensures empowerment. In contrast the absence of these intersected dimensions directly indicates disempowerment.

2.5.1 Skill and Deskilling in relation to Empowerment and Disempowerment

Considering its usage in every field, Parpart et al. (2002:5) describes “empowerment as seems to fit many shoes” thus, in this research the term (dis)empowerment is presented to explain skill and deskilling of migrant women. The relationship between skill and empowerment can be seen from gender perspective. Kabeer (1999:451) pointed out “women’s access to education/skill and job opportunity enhances their capacity to exercise agency”. Thus, “skill/education, employment and political participation as part of human resources, considered women empowerment” (Kabeer 2005:13). Skill in association to empowerment, therefore, implies not only empowerment, but exercising agency also. In relation to deskilling and disempowerment, it is not access to education as resource denied for migrant women, but employment as resource which is denied. Since, Kabeer (1999) put it forward that, resource takes the form of market and access to that resource is translated in to empowerment. Though Naila Kabeer and other literature on empowerment to my knowledge does not directly mention the association of deskilling and disempowerment. But from the exact interpretation of Kabeer’s (dis)empowerment concept logical association can be formulated. In this sense, denying choice for an individual reflects some profound situated constraints, which equates to disempowerment.” (Kabeer 1999:438)

2.5.2 Experience of Deskilling, Coping Mechanism to deal with Deskilling and (Dis) empowerment

Liversage (2009:135) call “deskilling as a major identity challenge or danger for those who experience it.” Different empirical research suggests migrants who are deskilled felt profound difficulty in attempting another job search in the future. Aguilar (1996) (as cited in Kofman and Raghuram 2005) said migrants who deskilled experience “transnational shame”, as they work in low skilled job compared to the previous job. Once their skilled/empowered identity is shattered due to obstacles, their dreams and achievements changed out to be in difficult circumstances for many skilled migrant women (Liversage 2009). Deskilling and its far-reaching consequence can be seen from the disempowerment idea. Since, the main idea for this research is deskilling has disempowering effect. Dealing and mechanism to deal with deskilling of migrant women is conceptualized in terms of Kabeer’s idea. Deskilled individual may take different mechanisms to deal with the situation. Literature on deskilling suggests those who are unable to reclaim their skilled identity due to absence of choice ended up channelling themselves towards to the unwanted scope that is to work in low skill jobs (Creese and Wiebe 2009). Migrants who are unable to retain their professional position in the host country search their own mecha-

nism to adapt with the situation. Mechanisms such as re-educating themselves or totally withdraw from the labor market (Liversage 2009). In explaining the chosen mechanism with Kabeer's idea, the major factor leads to virtual disempowerment is internalization of the labor market norms as unchanged. This is mainly because there are rules and norms that are taken for granted that operates at every level in very day life that produce disempowerment (Kabeer 1999).

Concluding Remark

In general, the literature and theoretical assumptions indicate skill as part of social science and economics concept how it is subjected to social construction and how socially constructed notion and measurement of skill are generally crafted to serve male bias and to creates demarcation between who works what and how it's valued. In this sense, woman as marginalized and subordinated group their skill and work, judged and valued according to the constructed identity, not on scientifically proven measurement independent of power intrusion.

Migration intrinsically, reproduces power and knowledge against women: women who suffer in their original place due to patriarchal system, migration also maintained the "universal patriarchy" impression that is claimed by main stream feminist movement, as responsible for the asymmetric division both locally and internationally. Kofman's (2005) observation of deskilling as a phenomenon more experienced by women than men in the migration trajectory confirms the above explanation. In sum, though, different explanation has been generated for the deskilling of migrant women from the economics domain of literature, however, the real labor market scenario is far from convincing what the economist forwarded as potential reasons for migrant people or women inclusion or invisibility in the labor market. In conceptualizing the notions (dis)empowerment the literature review uncovers how the two concepts (dis)empowerment go parallel in influencing the other in terms of exercising choices.

Chapter 3 : Research Methodology and Method

3.1 Methodology

The aim of this research is to examine labor market challenges of skilled Eritrean and Ethiopian migrants in the Netherlands. Based on empirical studies, different reasons come forward for the deskilling of an individual; for instance labor market barriers in the form of language, unrecognized credentials among other things. Meanwhile others also argues deskilling as happened more frequently for women; and argues that the very definition of skill by itself as not free from social construction and potentially contribute to deskilling (Figart 1997). Positioning myself in feminist approaches to skill and deskilling, and by associating to (dis)empowerment the analysis of this research paper is made. Thus, to indicate the (dis)empowered position of skilled Eritrean and Ethiopian migrant women in the Dutch labor market, linking deskilling to narrowing down choices or disempowerment will be explained using Naila Kabeer notions of (dis)empowerment.

Research Method

The research follows qualitative research method. The main reason to choice this method is mainly intended to respond to the broad rationale of the research and to the research questions. In this regard, the research uncovers what and how reasons and specific social categories/identities affect at every level to make deskilling and eventual disempowerment evident. In this sense this questions are not possible to answer using quantitative methods. Thus, the need to make significant departure from this method will be important to answer what reasons and how those social categories interact to produce specific constraints in accessing the skilled employment. To substantiate the aforesaid idea Redrnount (1995 as cited in Figart 1997:2) asserts “the economics or [positivist] labor market explanation of women participation in employment is largely dependent on double indicator (dummy variable) but, failed to consider how gender, [race and class] play a role in labor market communications”. Therefore, qualitative method is considered important to gender researchers for assessing the degree of heterogeneous social realty, in terms of gender, race and class relations that cannot easily be quantified by numerical values and interpretations (Beetham and Demetriades (2007). In view of qualitative research method importance in investigating reality on the ground from different angle, in-depth interview is used in this study.

3.2.1 Sampling Technique

The objective of the research is to get detailed information on migrant women's experience of disempowerment and/or deskilling. Hence, sampling technique is important technique that helps in ‘[providing] information rich cases for study in-depth’ (Patton, 1990: 169). I purposively selected information rich eleven informants based on some criteria like level and type of education, type of work before and after arrival to the Netherlands and age. Besides, I also applied snow ball Snowball sampling to identify participants, who fulfill the above criteria. Initially, the study was intended to conduct interview for 20

skilled migrant women; however, due to various reasons the sample size reduced to 11. In this regard, totally 11 Ethiopian and Eritrean skilled women migrants who are between 25 and 45 ages are participated in the interview.

3.2.2 Interview

Source of data for this research is obtained from in-depth interview with 11 Eritrean and Ethiopian migrant women. As it is mentioned in the literature part of this research, deskilling and disempowerment are caused due to diverse interrelated factors. Thus, to understand the various causes of these challenges in-depth interview employed, since use of interview as a research open doors to utilize other qualitative evidence (Figart 1997). Initially, to avoid time waste and to create comfortable the nature of the interview sent beforehand through email for some participants whose address is known. The communication language used to interview was Tigrinya and Amharic. If the informants were not comfortable in voice recording Jotting down of information served as an important tool to keep the time and to follow swift verbal communication, since to memorize every word is difficult as a human being (Bernard 2002). During the interview specific, question was not asked outside of socio-economic background information's; instead the broader research topic forwarded. The reason for choosing this method is to create enabling environment, as I understood they might generate new ideas that might be relevant to this study.

3.2 Desk Review

Those questions need to be answered from desk review that are, policy related, intersectionality and other theoretical issues, literature collected from ISS library and other relevant websites. Especially, in relation to Dutch Policy discourse. The research paper exclusively uses Korteweg (2005) and Roggeband and Verloo (2007) documents to establish arguments that Dutch emancipation policy has gap in addressing migrant women².

3.3 Data Analysis

The gathered data interpreted with greater consistency to produce meaningful sense and information in response to the research objective and question. Moreover, following, transcribing and interpreting the interview, classification was made on the commonalities and differences of the responses. As, Eritrean and Ethiopian migrant women found in different social categories that are, in gender, race and migrant status, thus, all possible labor market challenges are analyzed through the lenses of intersectionality. The presence of multiplicity of identity is important feature of migration and need intersectional response. Intersectionality as new concept in the feminist movement it came in response to respect magic of difference, to avoid generalization (homogenization) of women's issue. Intersectionality illuminates how power operates at different

² Since, the issue of gender and migration is addressed through Dutch emancipation policy; this research explicitly focuses on this policy.

level to produce multiple subordinations and how particular groups are excluded and marginalized. Lykke (2005) and Yuval-Davis (1997) in Knudsen (2007) forwards intersectionality analyzes the construction of power between gender, race, ethnicity, class. Intersectionality illuminates how socio-cultural hierarchies embedded with different discourses and institutions works and function to produce subordination within each layers of social categories (ibid). Within the context of migration, migrant women experience migration in different way than men and even from women of other different groups. This kind of experience can be explained and understood in terms of intersectional approach only, in which several grounds of discrimination can interact concomitantly to one particular groups (Makkonen 2002:13). In linking intersectionality with de-skilling and (dis)empowerment; as much empirical literature asserts the position of skilled migrates are shaped by interplay of different social categories, the allocation and accessibility of valued societal resources is also determined based on those social categories or positioning. In this sense, the causes of de-skilling and (dis)empowerment can be understood from Anthias (2001) as cited in Riaño and Baghdadi (2007:166) assertion that “the allocation of hierarchies of value, the devaluing of certain resources, and the resulting unequal access to socially valued resources may very much depend on class, gender and ethnicity.”

3.4 Ethical Consideration

In conducting this research, ethics was given prime importance to ensure the participants confidence in providing the information. The following research ethics were strictly applied in doing the interview.

- The purpose of the research was clearly explained and to whom the final document is going to be submitted.
- Why these participants are chosen for this specific interview also explained to avoid confusion.
- Their informed consent was strictly observed especially, in using voice recorder.
- In analyzing the data rules of confidentially applied in placing their names with anonymity and the gathered information.
- Because I am an Eritrean, Maximum possible effort was implemented to avoid leading questions so as not to produce biased information especially in relation to discrimination and other sensitive issues.

3.5 Reflection

To provide balanced information for this research, I took the initiative to interview employers, however, from the onset I am told that it will be a naive move to pose questions for an employer if he/she made discrimination to hire employee based on gender, migration status and race. Roughly even to ask the ethnic and gender composition of the organization. The other limitation was some of the interviewees were indifferent to cooperate, because most of them interviewed several times in different cases by different students from Dutch

educational institutions. They assume nothing different come out of this research.

Chapter 4 : Underlying Causes for Inability to Apply Human Capital in the Labor Market

4.1 Introduction

This chapter presents the data obtained from the in-depth interview. Under this chapter underlying causes of deskilling are discussed using migrants narration. In this regard key research finding indicates, lack of social network, unrecognizing foreign credentials, language proficiency and homogenization view cited as reason for migrants deskilling. The issue of “homogenization view” responded in two way under this section. First the Dutch emancipation discourse homogenizes vast women and it also considers migrant experience every problem in same regardless of their difference in experience and identity (Korteweg 2005:12). The second homogenization view tends to focus in relation to the dominant discourse that “migrants are generally framed as unskilled and passive in Dutch emancipation policy” (Roggeband and Verloo 2007:284). Thus, in response to these dominant framing of migrants as the same and unskilled the chapter presents to answer this two views. In this sense, by examining the presence of Eritrean and Ethiopian migrants as representing the colored people in the Netherlands, it indicates how this identity in addition to being as a women and migrant impacted them. Moreover, it also discusses how framing them as unskilled impacted their pursuit of employment. Parallel to the data analysis in-depth discussion presented with theoretical review to support the narratives. As it is mentioned in the methodology chapter based on some commonality of the responses in each sub section I presented 3 to 4 narration to represent the total respondents claim. I used this method to avoid duplication.

4.2 Socio Economic Background

Socio economic background of Eritrean and Ethiopian migrant constitute different pictures. Majority of the interviewee are found to be between the ages of 30 and 43 with the exception of one 47 age. The women interviewed all are educated with bachelor degree and M.A, of these, nine have B.A degree and one has masters degree and one with diploma. Prior to coming to the Netherlands, all mentioned that they were working in different institutions equivalent to their profession. With respect to their current employment status, most of the interviewees are engaged in various employment sectors mainly in domestic work, care taking, school supervision, secretary and self employment and some of them are unemployed. According to the, interviewee explanation even though they stayed here for a long period of time and do have residence permit, they could not get job by their profession. Hence, they are obliged to completely change their profession and then look for another job.

4.3 Process of Deskilling and Disempowerment

To access the labor market, migrants choose to re-educate themselves so as to fit in with the exiting labor market demand. Most of the respondents of this

research learned another profession below the previous qualification level. Small number of the respondent does remain unemployed due to the challenges. From the study outcome all the mentioned elements to deskilling are found to be central to the migrant's disempowerment. The key finding indicates as, these barriers are served to cause deskilling, experience with deskilled identity and coping mechanism to deal with deskilling causes as disempowerment. Deskilling of migrant women happened due to the presence of structural barriers in turn disempowerment results due to persistent deskilling.

Table 4.1 Research Participants

No	Name	Age	No of years in the Netherlands	Country of Origin	Occupation Prior to migration	Year of work experience in home country	Current Occupation	Level of education	Date of Interview
1.	Zaid	43	17	Ethiopian	Librarian	10	Voluntary	Diploma in library science and B.A social work	18th July 2012
2.	Tsega	38	13	Eritrean	Administrator	8	Cleaner	B.A in administration	15th July 2012
3.	Hedat	30	13	Eritrean	Teaching	2	Unemployed	B.A in Arts	5th August 2012
4.	Alganesh	38	12	Eritrean	Executive Secretary	5	Domestic worker	B.A in secretarial and office management	19th August 2012
5.	Yodit	43	14	Eritrean	Graduate Assistant	7	Nurse	B.A in agriculture	12th and 26th August 2012
6.	Meseret	39	16	Ethiopian	Teaching	7	Care giver	B.A in Biology and Diploma in Pharmacy	26th August 2012
7.	Sara	35	13	Ethiopian	Project Coordinator	3	Supervision in Kindergarten	B.A in accounting	22nd July 2012
8.	Feven	43	20	Eritrean	Assistant Human resource development	2	Secretary	B.A. in Public Administration	2nd September 2012
9.	Luwam	34	8	Eritrean	Geologist	7	Designer in cartography unit	M.A	25th August 2012
10.	Abebech	47	17	Ethiopian	Head of accounting department	8	Unemployed	B.A in accounting	9th September 2012
11.	Helen	29	10	Ethiopian	Head of facility service in NGO	2	Self employed	B.A in Marketing	28th July 2012

Source: Filed study from July 15 to September 9, 2012

4.4 Underlying Causes for inability to apply Human Capital in the Labor Market

Who you know has particular importance in accessing everything even the information.
(Sara, Interviewed 22nd July 2012)

4.4.1 Lack of Social Network

In this part of discussion Eritrean and Ethiopian migrant's interviewee highlights the absence or limited social network as a main problem to access the labor-market. According to the migrant's explanations social network as a get way to the labor market affects them in two ways:

- Concentration of relevant information in particular groups, which means outside of the designated group information regarding certain vacancy remain clandestine.
- Even if, information is accessed, the possibility of getting a job is difficult due to the presence of extended networks within any organization that stands to serve for particular group of interest. This means, the insider in the organization made lobby to allow their own person/group in the organization. This incident is related with McGovern's (2007) assertion that though, applicant's qualifications are equivalent or even outstanding employer's select workers mostly from networks approached from the existing workforce within the organization.'

The above mentioned lack of social net work as obstacle is confirmed by the skilled Eritrean and Ethiopian migrants. Zaid (43) an Ethiopian, who has diploma in library science and B.A in social work, got her B.A while working as librarian. Zaid has ten years of working experience as librarian, and currently she is working as a volunteer in an Ethiopian cultural organization. Zaid narrated her experience,

"Usually, I used to apply via the internet and other job advertising agency, but this method produced nothing except killing my time. Initially, I started to apply for a librarian post, until I got a vacancy on social work, but not accepted despite, I have the relevant skill pertinent to the advertised post [librarian] in school. Then, I honestly accepted that it is difficult to get job with my certificate, since the library system, here in the Netherlands is highly developed. To upgrade my knowledge in library science was difficult in cost wise.

Fortunately, I have B.A in social work I also tried with that one, but the same story. Imagine social work is highly demanded profession in this country, especially in hospitals and elderly institutions but where and how to get the information is mystery. Jobs are available in this country but the problem is how to get the information.

I applied for social worker post in an elderly protection institution, which other migrants [mentioned their name] applied, but the chance remain narrow. There are people who are information rich concerning certain jobs, however; these people tell the information to their in-group members only, and they tell all the relevant information to their people. Then for these applicant things will be much easier than the rest of us. No matter, how

many times you apply for a job it is useless effort. Comparing to other migrant's accessibility to information on the particular job, our position is very weak. Because, our social ladder in the society is below the other migrants who have stayed for long period of time and greater in number.”(Interviewed on 18th July 2012)

The challenge to compete with those who have wider social network in the labor market is also echoed in Feven’s recount. Feven (30) an Eritrean, who has B.A in public administration and worked in the ministry of local government as an assistant human-resource development officer in Eritrea for two years, and currently she is working as secretary in a small company explained,

“Though, I stayed in this county for quite long times I have no social network like any other migrants who have wider connection with their groups. Actually, I used the internet to search a job even I got the current job through internet advertisement. My experience in relation to social network, if I am not mistaken, it was before five years I had an Indian friend who was working as a receptionist in a hotel [Mentioning the name] and told me the hotel owner was looking for a manager, and she told me to apply and I did so, I got no response from that hotel. Thereafter, I asked my friend regarding the job I applied for; she replied it is already occupied. My friend explains to me, there are people who work in that hotel, they are also migrants [mentioning their identity] they learned that the manager is looking for someone to hire. Actually, I am not so sure whether he [the manager] made an interview with the new person, but he got it. In searching job sometimes you would know they will not employ you by observing people who are surrounding, but you say, let me try and see my chance. Thereafter, until I get this job I worked in different jobs below my skill, for example as a cleaner and waitress. One thing surprises me in this country is, they never encourages you to work they like to give you only the welfare I don’t know what is the advantage, but they remain reluctant. (Interviewed 2nd August 2012)

Even if they manage to get the relevant information on the posted vacancy, but to bargain and negotiate in unknown environment without having social capital reasonably remain difficult. The ability to penetrate and compete with those who have a wider social network remains challenging for these migrants. Because, information is power and resource on its own right, those who have made grip on the organization can tell the detailed nature of the job scrutiny to their fellow in-group members. Then the new job seekers will be well equipped to answer any job scrutiny mechanism. Social network restricts the available information in favour of particular ethnic groups. In sum the process indicates information regarding employment is concentrated and limited to serve particular group. Moreover, the event may also be accepted as unchanged traditional phenomenon of the labor market. As a result the individual job seeker may internalize the situation and lead to total shift of employment choice like what Zaid did.

From the finding migrants repeatedly mention the presence of specific ethnic names that have strong social networking. For these migrant women, to penetrate the well situated social network remains difficult. The social networking by virtue of its position creates exclusion on its own right. In this regard, out of such exclusion deskilling as occurrence is inevitable, but disempowerment exacerbated as these migrants becoming more and more alienated from every job opportunity.

The challenge is clear in Abebech's explanation, she has B.A in accounting with eight years working experience in Ethiopian regional bank as head of accounting unit, previously she was working in small restaurant as a cashier, and currently she is unemployed. She explained her experience,

"I applied for a clerk work post in a hotel some years back, I got that information, while I was working as a cleaner in that hotel, but I was not hired and found migrants people [mentioning their name] with lower credentials were hired. You know sometimes things are really discouraging, but you continue to live. Observing this difficulty, I established contact with certain migrant people, who stayed here for long time, however, still these people closed off in terms of giving out the relevant information to us. Thereafter, I started to ask people to get me jobs like, cleaning and other domestic works." (Interviewed 9th of September 2012)

The collective narration indicates the inaccessibility of such social networking apparently leads the migrant women to channel themselves to already be conditioned or feminized employment opportunities. Migrant's agency is replaced by sense of difficulty; social net works as part of the wider labor market shapes their employment opportunity. When they are restricted to access information, equivalent to their skill, they are at threat of deskilling and eventual disempowerment. Since, access is at the center of everything; in this regard, access to resource (information) seems narrowed, thus the way to disempowerment will be apparent.

Differently, from Zaid and Feven narration, un-able to get the opportunity due to the social network but Sara, who got the advantage from social network describes.

Sara (35) Ethiopian, who has B.A in accounting worked as a project coordinator in NGO in Eritrea for three years, and currently working as a supervisor in kindergarten explains her experience,

"First I started to apply through the internet and other regular information centres. However, I was not able to get the job, except calling me for an interview; in the meantime I was working as domestic work to support myself and family back home. I met a friend who told me to apply for school supervision, and I got the job and worked there till 2008, whilst, many of my friends who arrived earlier remain unemployed. I got that opportunity, because a friend of my friend told her, if she knew someone who can work as a supervisor in kindergarten. Sara added you know if you come through the social network the employers don't even focus on the formal criteria, for example language." (Interviewed 22nd July 2012)

In contrast to the aforesaid explanation hindered or accessed a job due to social network. Luwam (34) an Eritrean who has M.A. worked in various NGOs for more than 7 years as a geologist in Sothorn Sudan, and currently employed in a government institution in cartography unit as a (designer) forwards her accounts,

"I applied through advertisement on the internet. I applied to an organization, and the manager told me that my language ability was not good enough for the posted vacancy. Afterwards, I started to work below my skill level in various jobs. Thereafter, I applied for another job through the Internet and got the job, this time the manager was a little bit hesitant about my language but he allowed me to work and until this very day he is

not complaining about my language. However, in relation to my experience of social network when you are rejected through the formal channel due to assumed language inability and unrecognized your academic credentials you also experience difficulty from the informal channel (network) you know social networks also has their assumption on their own right to channel us on the unskilled job. I met individuals who are rich in information, they also never told me where I can get job pertinent to my skill, instead they refer me on cleaning, domestic work and other low skill works, while the same people tell relevant information to other job seekers.” (Interviewed on July 25th, 2012)

Sara and Luwam explanation might lead to realize how individual or employer intuitive judgment in association with social networks, play a role in getting the right employment. In sum, migrant’s capacity to access employment is determined by their social network not skill or working experience. Moreover, Luwam’s explanation reminds two possible results in connection to the labor market characteristics and job searching mechanisms. First It indicates the presence of androcentric pattern in the social network, which means by holding the information, they [the network] discourages women job seekers to look only to the feminized categories of work or migrant women dominated occupations. The second is, as it mentioned in the literature formal method of job searching as advantageous for women job seekers; in this regard, Luwam’s explanation may be associated with that assertion.

However, as it cited in chapter two, that gender shapes the role of social network. Skilled Eritrean and Ethiopian migrant women might be also influenced by this pattern, as social network is dominated by men and subject to influence of power Huffman and Torres (2001). The possibility to influence or penetrate the surrounding environment might reasonably difficult for these migrant women.

In every aspect of their job hunting, social network function as effective instrument to exclude them from accessing employment. The overwhelming majority of the interviewee in the research sample firmly claims an absence of social network stands as a major hindrance to access the employment. In general, social network is found to be a key element in either, to facilitate suitable employment or to facilitate inequality for those who have no network. In linking social network as major impediment to employment with the concept of disempowerment; since, norms and means place some over another through dominance and discriminate the choice available to each group (Flobere 1994 in Kabeer 2009). In this sense social network as dominant group and means controls the way to channel migrant to low skilled jobs.

4.4.2 Unrecognizing Foreign Credentials

From the total participants of this research, six interviewee, mentioned unrecognizing their academic and work credentials as a barrier to their employment. Unrecognizing credentials for these migrants may directly sound like part of the labor market barrier; however, the real reflection might correspond with the social construction of skill.

Regardless the level of education and accreditation of their documents, but who [male or female] holds and where the certificate is obtained matters in finding employment.

This claim is evident in the following remarks,

Abebech,

'I applied for accounting post advertised in internet, the organization I applied for was government organization [mentioning the name]. They clearly told me that I need local certificate to join the organization. If accounting is different from my country I don't know but I got this response. Abebech added you may not be accepted in certain organization due to language inability, and when you improve your language and made similar attempt to find job, they questioned your academic credential and consider it as if it is not relevant to their demand.'

Helen (29) an Ethiopian who has B.A. in marketing and working in international NGO as head of facility service for two years and currently self employed tells her unrecognized academic credential experience,

'I applied to a vacancy posted which commensurate with my qualification, and they invited me for interview, thereafter through email they told me that though, they are impressed with my working experience in an NGO, but they said they need locally trained person. Considering this I started to register to re-educate myself in the same specialization I have, but I found out that all the courses that are listed for marketing are already listed in my credentials. Then I decided to leave searching job and find my own way to lead my life. I can say it is not the quality but where you obtained has a meaning for getting the employment.' (Interviewed 28th July 2012)

Yodit, (43) Eritrean who has B.A in agricultural science and worked in collage of agriculture in Eritrea as graduate assistant for seven years, thereafter reeducate herself in nursing here and currently working in hospital said,

'I applied for nursing [care taking], even if it is below my qualification level they rejects me and they never say you are over qualified. For me to say you are over qualified sounds at least they acknowledged my credentials. Thus, I assume there must be a problem of acceptance. But the same organization they accepted the small training I got her instead of B.A and the work experience I had '(Interviewed in 12th and 26th August 2012)

Feven,

'For example, I have B.A in public administration at the same time I have certificate in secretarial science, when I applied in vacant post in certain organization for public administration post, I got no response even for interview. When I started to apply for secretary post I got sometimes green light. I remember some years back I got the chance of employment, unfortunately it was due date and I withdraw the offer.' If you apply for jobs proportionate below your qualification the credential recognition does not matter. The problem arises when you start to look jobs which are proportionate with your skill."

Alganesh,

'There is a problem in accepting my academic credentials. Though there is an agency set up to make accreditation for foreign credentials [Mentioning the name of the agency]; however, in getting job with it also remains impossible. In addition to this even if they accept it they demand local job

experience which is difficult. How could it be possible to have local experience while you face persistent rejection in every job vacancy?’

As it mentioned earlier unrecognized their credentials might be due to where the credentials are obtained or who possessed it. As it was mentioned, in chapter two, that skill is socially constructed and dominated with positivist approach of explanation. In this regard, their skill may undervalue because of the subjective dimensions, influenced by assumption and generalization (Esposto 2008 and Holman 2000). In this sense, their academic credentials are unrecognized, might be due to the fact that it is possessed by women and/or it is obtained from third world.

In addition to above mentioned discussion within the context of the social construction of skill. Unrecognizing foreign credentials may go with the power domination of some group in the labor market. This greater emphasis on local academic credential may indicate mechanism of creating demarcation between native people and migrant. Since, skill are socially demarcated, and to maintain the demarcated grips between the dominant and subordinate various mechanisms are introduced, among these are credentialsism (Esposto 2008)

From the deskilling and disempowerment analysis point of view one of the pre-condition for making effective choice in empowerment is resource; and it takes in the form of tangible allocations or can be expressed through claim. In this sense the migrant’s ability to access the labor market in the form of claim through their academic credential is constrained. Since, labor market cannot be allocated directly to an individual; instead they accessed it through right full claim using their skill and legal documents (Kabeer 1999). However, in this migrant case the capacity to make claim from the available resource is largely narrowed or removed. Since every possibility is closed due to barriers for instance by assuming they lack language skills and unrecognized foreign credentials among other things. Resource as one way of choice enhancement in ensuring empowerment, it is not on the right place to be accessed by these migrants, because it is already influenced either through barriers or discursive construction.

4.4.3 Dutch Language Proficiency cited as Problem

The interviewees who are un-able to access the labor market through a social network voiced the presence of other barriers, i.e. in the form of language skill. From their response, language is found to be the most pronounced impediment to gain the job opportunity with proportionate skill. Not different from the role of social networking, language inability as a reason also restricts their choice, as they encounter more rejection from every job application. This idea is apparent in Tsega’s explanation,

Tsega (38) Eritrean who has B.A in administration, and previously worked in Ethiopian Ministry of Foreign affairs as an administrator for almost eight years, and thereafter she worked in the Eritrean embassy here in the Netherlands for two years and left that office due to personal reasons, current-

ly; she is working as a cleaner in an elderly protection institute. Tsega 'explains her circumstances,

"I applied for administration posts several times and failed to get the job. The common response I usually got from the organizations I applied for was I have poor language proficiency. However, I have enough knowledge of the language and able to communicate without any difficulty. Parallel to searching job commensurate with my skill I worked as a waitress for a short while, I had a chance to develop my language ability. For instance, I applied for administration post in textile factory work, which does not need language proficiency that much, but still the language mentioned as a problem. From my experience what I observed is when you ask for low-skilled jobs the problem of language does not frequently arise they [employer] even manages to be flexible to understand you or correct some minor language gaps." (Interviewed on August 15th July 2012)

Tsega's years of suffering actually forced her to work in low skill. The ups and downs leave her with only one situation to be deskilled and to accept deskilling and unwanted disempowered identity.

Similarly, Feven tells her account that,

"I would say there is a problem of discrimination. I live here for 23 years I know the language very well, but still it remains a way of an excuse to deter me from getting the job. Sometimes you said which language they are talking about "if it is Dutch, I know it very well." For me, language was the most voiced problem for not allowing me to the employment of public administration. But thereafter I started to look for jobs in secretary I had short-course training in secretarial science. My experience of job hunting in the secretary field was; I applied to two organizations at the same time. However, the other organization told me I have language problem but this company [the current organization I am working in] they even not bother about it, I applied for the same post [secretary]." (Interviewed on 22nd July 2012)

Alganesh (32) an Eritrean, who has B.A in secretarial science and office management and who works in government organization as an executive secretary in Eritrea for five years and now working as a domestic worker said on her part

'I applied for a secretarial job in small factory but failed to get it the mentioned reason was my language ability. No matter whether the language is important or not for the job, you applied for, but the employer need you to speak it, which is the main problem here. For example, I started to work as waitress certain years back nothing happens the problem of language does not arise as a barrier to deter me from getting it, but the difficulty begins when you apply for office works. They use language as a barrier for everything, without recognizing your ability to work as efficient as possible.' (Interviewed on 19th August 2012)

The issue may demonstrate entrance to the labor market is predicted on the basis of assumption embedded in generalization. And it coincides with Van Laer and Janssens (2011: 1222) prediction that 'even though ethnic minorities speak Dutch well, they are still confronted with the assumption they probably will not'. Language proficiency as barrier exclusively happens to all respondents regardless of the relevant skill valued to access the job opportunity. The key finding in relation to language indicates it is not language per

se working against their choice and agency but, the dominant perception and assumed place in the labor market. Labor market emerges to deny these migrant women access to job for reasons not related to their academic qualification. The event also reminds the contrasting situation between investing enormous amount of money on language training to integrate migrants with the Society and the inherent labor market behavior which prohibits migrants to get job opportunity in the name of language proficiency. In this section of migrant's narration it is difficult to accept their claim, because certain employment demands good language to facilitate the day to day work. In this regard the possibility to be rejected will be apparent considering Dutch language is their second language. In summation, it is evident from the migrant's narration that there might be an assumption that migrant's lack language proficiency.

4.4.4 The Presence of Intersecting Identity and Intersectional Discrimination

This section will highlight the presence of multiplicity of identity and how each identity produces constraint to alienate migrants from the labor market mainly from skilled employment. The presence of this section specifically will respond to the homogenization view that framed migrants as "internally coherent, same and supposedly experience problem in the same manner in the Netherlands" (Korteweg 2005:12).

As, gender interplay with ethnic, race and other social categories (McDowell 2008) Skilled Eritrean and Ethiopian migrants are experience challenge as a women, migrant, and women of color. These migrant women do not directly refer their intersecting identity served as "visible" challenge to access the employment. Visible refers to suggest they are not discriminated directly by saying you are women, migrant or directly even black, but explained how the exclusively constructed identities in the labor market create choice restriction at every level. They forwarded, though the main causes for their inability to use their skill in the labor market is due to lack of social network, language proficiency and unrecognized skill however, they identifies it is more the constructed identity by and large play a role to deter them from accessing the labor market and eventually to restrict their choice.

Therefore, looking on specific identity is also important to understand how intersecting identities facilitates specific constraints in relation to deskilling and disempowerment. As it has been observed from migrant's narration that social network has ethnic features, which means particular ethnic groups have important network. The position of ethnicity seems to matter as powerful instrument to access the information and the job opportunity. Social network maintains hierarchization within the migrant population and reflects how some segments of migrants are more prone to discrimination. From this segment of migrants, there are other social categories, which might add value to produce multiple subordinations.

Though, traditionally, women segregated in the labor market due to gender in their home place; the situation becomes worse in migration. Additional identity construction and constraints emerged based on class³ and race, and these identities determine who works what and where to work in the labor-market. For these migrant the interplay of race, class and gender might produce multiple segregation. The presence of intersecting identities in getting a job equivalent with their academic skill is evident in the migrant's narration.

Tsega,

"Language proficiency and work experience presents as a pretext for not accepting me to the position which I applied for, but, thereafter I learned in addition to being women it is my skin colour, which hampered me not to get the desired job. As I observed the position I applied for was occupied by other migrant's, for example [mentioning their name]."

As, it is apparent from the above narration, these migrant women never compare their segregation and subordination experience against the Native Dutch, but they compare their position with other migrant's position. This identity comparison was most evidently spoken by Zaid expression,

'As African and as women, our social ladder is placed below all other migrant people e.g. Turks, Surinam's. To access the labor market either through the formal channel or the social network, we have to penetrate this entire ladder, which seems impossible bearing multiple identities.'

These migrant women bear multiple identities, with a greater chance to be excluded and suppressed in each category. In response to this multiple subordinate location, they started to search for their own solution, by either engaging in low skill jobs or totally avoid job searching. From their explanation,

Hedat (30) an Eritrean who has B.A in Art and Language previously working as English teacher for two years and currently un-employed explains,

"I just don't wish even to apply for work I attempted several times; in addition to reason of language inability, being migrant and women also deters me from getting the job. If you apply for job either they prefer men or from the other migrants [mentioning their name] even when you get job through the social net work if they are kind enough to tell you information they guide you where those low skill jobs are available. Because what is in their mind as a women and migrant that [domestic work or menial work] position is already reserved for us." (Interviewed 5th of August 2012)

The more they discriminated the may face choice restriction, their capacity to choose might shaped by gender, migration status, race and class thus, the interplay of those categories might puts them in multiple negative

³ Bourdieu (1986) in Degele and Winker (2011:55) mentions 'class reflects the social origin of a person; the cultural resource of education and profession as well as the resource of social networks and relationships'. However, in relation to these migrant women all the mentioned resources that constitute class is absent due to barriers. In this sense their class position will be considered as lowered.

positions compare to native population and migrant men. Since, when each of social categories intersected with each other normally exacerbates the discrimination and inequality associated with them (Kabeer 2012). In this sense, the phenomenon of deskilling does come out from direct structural barriers, but sense of disempowerment emerges due to choice restriction based on each identity location. The situation might coincide with Crenshaw's (1991) assertion that when every social category interacts they produce intersecting disempowerment.

4.4.4.1 Framing Migrant's as "Unskilled" category

"Image matters to access everything" (Yodit interviewed 12th and 26th August 2012)

Beside the above mentioned difficulty Eritrean and Ethiopian women migrant's might also experience challenges from dominant discourses that frames migrant people as unskilled and passive in the Netherlands (Roggeband and Verloo, 2007). This categorical framing what Mohanty(1998) call it arbitrarily/homogenously constructed identity, that third world women are uneducated, might significantly impacted the process of job finding. In this sense, while skilled Eritrean and Ethiopian migrants are considerably endure various challenges due to lack of social network, unrecognized credentials and assumed they lack language skills. They mentioned, unskilled image negatively narrowed their ability to act as skilled in the labor market. This dominant discourse towards vast migrant people especially against women hampered them not to go further beyond the delimited assumed position, which means to congregate in unskilled position. This first encounter before any other barrier is exclusively narrated in the following interviewee recount,

Yodit,

"You know starting from the integration process they [the immigration authority] even if, you explain them you have skill they never separate you from other unskilled migrants, and started to treat you as if you know nothing. Even at latter stage this causes challenge in accessing job because, the same history follows everywhere. All this assumption impacted our journey of job hunting. Because of this assumption even if you get jobs through social net work they don't tell you where skilled job is available, instead they tell you where the domestic work, care giving or any other low skilled job is available."

Sara,

"Our image is image of unskilled dependent that needs constant training and education without the perceived information upon us is genuine or not. When you apply, they [employer] even do not ask you from which African country you are, as they consider all of us as one and the same because of our skin color. Because of this unskilled image to work in low skill job also considered as the only option for migrant women."

Helen

"In this country I am accepted with greater hospitality and care and still I am contented for that. However, when it comes to perception there is a problem and nothing has done to change our image. This is evident in our day to day life. To get job with the skill you have is very narrow, but to get a job in domestic work or any other low skilled job is ok. When you see a lot of migrant women working

in low skilled job it is impossible to imagine all of them are uneducated, but something is getting wrong, as for me it is image. I feel empty because I am an able to do something for this country with my skill.”

Challenged with the reality that they are unable to apply their human capital, the respondents overwhelmingly blamed the homogenization attitude for hampering them in pursuit of job finding by depicting them as one and the same. The outcome of the interview might endorse the prevailing reality and perception in host country image of migrant people. Since, they experience difficulty to access it while having skill valued for employment. The migrant’s experiences might indicate, entrance to the labor market is predicted on the basis of discursive assumption and generalization not on skill or language ability as mainstream labor market analysts predicted. Therefore, their choice and chance might also predict on the basis of that generalization regardless of their heterogeneity, particularly in reference to educational status.

Chapter 5 : Experience of Deskilling and Existing Mechanisms Dealing with Deskilling

5.1 Introduction

This chapter presents experience of deskilling and migrant's mechanism to deal with the experience of deskilling. Under this chapter experience of deskilling and mechanism to deal with deskilling is explicitly presented to explain the disempowerment of skilled Eritrean and Ethiopian women migrant.

5.2 Experience of Deskilling and migrants agency

The experience of deskilling is challenging transition. When their skilled identity compromised in favor of deskilling outside their home country it causes identity challenge (Liversage 2009). Skilled Eritrean and Ethiopian migrant women narration also echoes the scholar's prediction. Most of the interviewee sees the situation as major challenge both for present and future career. They narrate the experience and challenge in the following remarks,

Hedat,

"You know what I feel to tell you frankly, yes in the Netherlands you get basic needs (food, shelter and clothe) but when it comes to the brain it is empty, I have never felt un-comfortable like this. When you are not able to access job with your education you fill handicapped and forced to live with embarrassment. But, no choice the option is only to accept it and to assimilate with it, since; there is no-any other option to depend on."

Tsega,

"I feel uncomfortable when I ask myself how my friends back home could react when they see me working as a cleaner. I compare and contrast my previous occupation and with this occupation and feel shame. I regretted the time I spent to get education. I killed all the precious time in favour education I wish I was married and have children. I had no sense and imagination that I will find myself in this situation in developed country.' Now I started to focus on to my background economy which means to support my family at home. I relinquished my interest and let off my academic qualification and started to work as a cleaner in the elderly protection institution."

Zaid,

"You know totally my deep expectation is shattered. Previously, I had a strong belief that in developed world value and education is more important than knowing individual. At this moment my feeling is overwhelmed by sense of unskilled person. I don't think so from now on ward I will search job with my credentials I lost all my confidence."

Feven,

"Had I known how skilled migrant women are suffering in getting job, I would've chosen another option within my own country. I would not also spend years to search job equivalent to my skill. If you see it from women position all in all everything is time killing."

Helen,

“I started to work below my skill level in various jobs. When I decided to do in the unskilled jobs I accepted it as a usual event that happens to every skilled migrant woman. But I am not suggesting that I was not humiliated but to explain it is a reality.”

I feel embarrassed and regretted my deep expectation is shattered were the most readily response from all the interviewee. Before migration they were able to work in a job which is proportionate to their academic skills which gave rise to exercise their free agency through choice as independent. This autonomy gave them even to challenge the dominant expectation of early marriage, for example majority are not married with the exception of two respondents who are divorced, the status might helped them to find jobs without pressing issues in household. Dealing with Deskilling identity offer them sense of embarrassment when they experience choice restriction at every level. The challenges they face in search of a job forced them to rethink the time spent in education and work, and they consider it as neither useful nor lasting. Regardless, of the amount of money they got before migration from their employment at least they felt a sense of self-esteem compared to the current feeling of loss of self-esteem. The experience of deskilling bay and large might influenced their sense of agency.

As Kabeer (1999: 437) noted agency implies the ability to make the right full choice and take the form of bargaining and negotiating to achieve one's goal. In this regard, the ability to penetrate the resource/labor market is supposedly dependent on their agency through meaningful negotiation with their skill; however, the migrant's agency might dominate by “power over”⁴. Since, power operates at different level to control or dominate the agency of others (Kabeer 1999). To substantiate this claim chapter 2 of this research also elaborated the presence of asymmetric power relation in the labor market and how it influence the labor market characteristics.

5.3 Coping Mechanism to deal with Process of Deskilling

The above mentioned cumulative challenges might make migrant women to internalize the situation and forced to search private solution to overcome their needs or to engage their life in work. However, the coping mechanism to deal with the process of deskilling has its own effect both for the individual migrant who experience it and for other skilled migrants who are on the way to search job at relevant skill. For this migrant women to reeducate or to remain unemployed may indicate internalization of the labor market situation as normal or unchanged. From Kabeer's analysis point of view internalization of certain situation has disempowerment effect.

One's their deep expectation is shattered; they pursue personal mechanism, which they might believe right place to accommodate them. By accept-

⁴ Kabeer (1999) uses the term “power over” to suggest the asymmetric power relations that exist and outside of an individual control by other dominant people

ing the situation, skilled Eritrean and Ethiopian migrants women attempt to deal with deskilling using two mechanisms,

- Re-educate themselves lower than the previous level to engage in new profession for example in care taking or nursing
- And total withdrawal from the labor market or remain unemployed.

Those who re-educate themselves might choose it to fit in occupations where other female unskilled migrants predominantly channeled in. Tsega elaborates here chosen mechanism,

Tsega,

‘Soon after, realizing that it is difficult to penetrate the country’s labor market with the existing skill; I swiftly shifted my mind to acquire training in care taking to support my family back home. I choose the care taking because it was the only available option. She added you know to be accepted in the nursing school, I totally changed my CV history [to avoid over qualified response from the organization] to fit the demand of the nursing school. But I got the chance after my productive age is consumed. Now I convinced myself that I have to accept everything that it is not my place and country which I can claim and protest.’

Zaid on her part,

“Understanding that to find a job is impossible with my skill both as librarian and social worker; I started to look for a job as a volunteer. I reshaped my life and started to work as a volunteer to this very day. My professional identity was short lived no more professional status, I give up no more.”

Recognizing the status quo by itself might produces its own discourse and assumption towards the wider labor market regardless, the presence of different actors with different attitudes towards migrant people. Since, deskilling is downward mobility thus; the chosen mechanism to reeducate themselves below the previous skill level causes deskilling on its own right and causes disempowerment in terms of the choice they made. Accordingly, this choice might not be taken as meaning full choice, since it is not come out from their sense of free agency but due to lack of choice and survival reasons.

Furthermore, as Kabeer explains choice is essentially indicates the presence of alternatives, as all choices are removed from the labor market, then the migrant’s remaining alternative might be to channeled to unskilled jobs. In this sense, it can be said that this migrant women are either exercising agency or accessing the resource. Accordingly, disempowerment will be evident, since what is chosen in life evidently contributes to the wellbeing of those making the choice (Kabeer 1999).

The other preferred option to deal with deskilling situation is the total withdrawal from searching jobs pertinent to relevant skill. The option is evident in the following remarks,

Abebech,

“I stopped searching jobs in my profession, and completely changed my focus to jobs that commensurate with my skill. I don’t have even the de-

sire to search job in accounting. Now I said to myself If I got a job that can support me in getting adequate earnings for my living, no matter, what the type of work, I will accept it. For me I stopped searching job in accounting before some years back.”

Hedat,

“I accepted everything, so I decide to do my own way. Though, it is another time consuming, currently I started participating in a nursing home program. And I will see what will happen in the future with this profession.”

The experience of deskilling as regular phenomenon may transmit to successive skilled migrants also. This argument coincides with Meseret’s account; learning that deskilling is inevitable occurrence she channeled herself to already predicted occupations before making any job finding attempt.

Meseret (39) an Ethiopian who has B.A in biology and Diploma in pharmacy previously working as teacher at high school level as a teacher with 6 years of working experience choose to give up and follow the line said,

Meseret,

“Before I started any attempt to find job, my older sister told me not to waste my time in searching job with my professional skill. She deeply [her sister] explained me, history of other migrant’s [from Ethiopia] fruitless attempt of job finding and how they end up working in low skill jobs. Since, she was senior migrant, her concern push me not to search jobs and decided to re-educate myself in care taking.” (Interviewed 26th August 2012)

By discouraging others not to engage in pursuit of job finding, deskilling and its multiplier effect might become part of discursive assumption on its own right. This is to mean that just as the host country environment perceived migrant as one and the same category; migrants on their side may also interpret and internalize every experience with in the same assumption. Meseret’s explanation echoes this idea, assuming she will face the same problem she dropped searching job equivalent to her skill.

Furthermore, the transition of deskilling might significantly contributed to their disempowerment, the choices made either to re-educate and to withdraw from the labor market by external power made them to internalize the challenges as permanent characteristics of the labor market. The internalization process might threaten their free agency before making any attempt. The agency which Kabeer said exercised at individual and collective level through bargaining and negotiations fails to happen and linked in more direct way to disempowerment through internalization of the event. In sum, the chosen mechanism in both cases seems to an end of professional life or a way through which disempowerment become apparent.

Their perception of the situation as unchangeable and to gear their minds towards internalizing the circumstance might considerably creates sense of disempowerment. Because, the issue of “power imbalance function in shaping their choice or career naturalizing the status-quo while delegitimizing and marginalizing [their] choice” (Fiol 1991, Hardy and Leiba-O’Sullivan 1998, Walsh et al. 1981 as cited in Van Laer and Janssens 2011:1206). From the migrants narration, once they fail to get employment

with the skill at hand, obtained from their original place, the possibility of re-educating themselves in similar educational status might be difficult. They choose to reeducate themselves so as to assimilate in the already segmented and segregated employment sectors.

This experience coincides with Kabeer's (1999:441) assertion that internalizing certain situation reflects power relations are manifested not only through the exercise of agency and meaning full choice, but also through the types of choices people make. In this sense, the type of choice they made may definitely disempower them, as they move to down ward mobility.

Response to the barriers might put them in a more subordinate position and produce deskilling and disempowerment in more direct way. Acceptance the situation as unchanged may due to the internalization of the situation. This might be due to some norms that are taken for granted that operates at every level and that believed as unchanged (Kabeer 1999). In sum, from the skilled Eritrean and Ethiopian migrant women narration, neither the resource nor the agency was accessed and exercised evidently. Thus, the absence of this two interconnected dimensions of choice and pillar of empowerment, indicates nothing but entrenched restriction on the ability to choose that might be apparent sign of real disempowerment (ibid).

Chapter 6 : Conclusion and Recommendation

6.1 Introduction

In this research paper I am not uncritically arguing that migration does not provides employment opportunities for migrant women or rejecting its important contribution on economic gain, independence and greater autonomy for women who were denied labor participation and even movement from one place to another. In addition to this, I am not also saying host country labor market and policy is totally hostile towards migrant women. Instead, in this research paper I want to highlight women empowerment in migration trajectory needs main focus.

6.2 Conclusion and Recommendation

The outcome of the collective narration made it clear how their skilled identity is threatened by reasons not related to their skill. The obstacles faced by these migrants in the labor market mainly relied on structural barriers in the form of lack of social network, unrecognizing credentials, assumed they lack language proficiency. The finding noticeably, indicates these migrant women are denied from skilled job opportunities, despite having relevant skill and work experiences. Social network which is influenced by male and particular ethnics cited as the most influential reason for their discouragement to the skilled employment opportunity.

Consequently, all the interviewees are working below their level of education except one respondent whose work is suitable with her academic skill, but at initial stage, she also reported to work in un-skilled jobs. Migrant's ways of dealing with the deskilled identity vary. To overcome economic needs and to avoid idleness, most of these migrants engaged in low skill occupations by re-educating themselves below the previous educational level. The rest chooses withdrawal from the labor market as an ultimate alternative to deal with the situation. In sum, they narrated how the loss of their empowered identity throws them back to disempowered position with no hope as their age and knowledge fades away through time.

Based on the study outcome there are important things needs to be considered to facilitate migrant's access to the labor market and to ensure empowerment.

- Creation of centralized information center related to job vacancy, so as to be accessible to all citizens, as it reduces exclusion of particular groups and have quantifiable effect on balancing the labor market opportunities of women and minority groups (Drentea 1998)
- Though, some migrants claim they rejected, despite they have accredited their document. Establishment of accreditation institution is important step to reduce the barrier. It seemingly reduces the existing social construction of skill, since who and where it obtained matters.

- The migrant's essential narrative indicates the presence of multiplicity of identity and based on those identities how they are challenged to access employment. In this sense, their situation calls for considering inclusive policy. As they are excluded from the emancipation policy discourses and apparently considered experienced every problem in the same manner.
- Indeed, being in developed country their practical needs (basic needs) are fulfilled, but paradoxically, being in developed country their strategic interest (need) remains at question. Therefore, in order to understand the strategic interest the overall asymmetric power imbalance has to be checked. Indeed, Kabeer (1999:437) said 'there is a logical association between poverty and disempowerment,' but in contrast to this idea for this migrant case it is not resource shortage leads them to disempowerment, instead the power of discourse which hampers them from accessing the labor market; in this regard it is the dominant power of discourse need to be investigated which creates choice restriction at every level that creates disempowerment (Ghorashi and Tilburg 2006). Since, one way of ensuring empowerment is the removal of all barriers that hinder an individual to make effective choice in important life matters (Gootaert 200 in Ibrahim and Alkire (2007). Language excellence, human capital and professional experience cannot change the labor market system, because the mere problem is not on lack of those requirements rather, on the unequal power relations between different actors. This power must be investigated carefully as this kind of power is directly connected with the process of inclusion and exclusion of particular group that operates at different level (Foucault 1978 in Knudsen 2006).
- In general the need to focus on the overall gender equality is important factor, because it views the broader picture of women and the socially constructed identities. Finally, to produce meaning full claim regarding potential barriers and current state of discrimination in the labor market, it is significant to conduct in-depth qualitative research to understand the wider migrants poison.

Appendices

Appendix 1: Interview Guidelines

1. Level of Education?
2. Elaborate your employment history?
3. What methods do you use for applying for a job?
4. What are the possible obstacles you face in pursuit of job finding?
5. Explain your career, since becoming migrant women? How has it changed?
6. Explain elaborately your experience and challenges in the labor market?
7. Are you discouraged because of those difficulties?
8. What are the possible Mechanisms used to cope up with the challenges?

References

- Attewell, P. (1990) 'What is Skill?', *Work and Occupations* 17(4): 422-448.
- Beetham, G. and J. Demetriades (2007) 'Feminist Research Methodologies and Development: Overview and Practical Application', *Gender and Development* 15(2): 199-216.
- Bernard, H.R. (2002) *Research Methods in Anthropology: Qualitative and Quantitative Methods*. Walnut Creek, CA [etc.]: AltaMira Press.
- Central Bureau of Statistics (2005) 'African Immigrants in the Netherlands'. Accessed on 10th May 2012 <<http://www.cbs.nl/nr/rdonlyres/f44fa0e8-e311-4e30-802e-22ac58d5a966/0/2005k3b15p083art.pdf>>.
- Creese, G. and B. Wiebe (2009) 'Survival Employment': *Gender and Deskillling among African Immigrants in Canada*, *International Migration*.
- Crenshaw, K. (1991) 'Mapping the Margins: Intersectionality, Identity Politics, and Violence Against Women of Color', *Stanford law review*: 1241-1299.
- Deere, C.D. and M.L. De Leal (2001) *Empowering Women: Land and Property Rights in Latin America*. Univ of Pittsburgh Pr.
- Drentea, P. (1998) 'Consequences of Women's Formal and Informal Job Search Methods for Employment in Female-Dominated Jobs', *Gender and Society* 12(3): 321-338.
- Elson, D. (1999) 'Labor Markets as Gendered Institutions: Equality, Efficiency and Empowerment Issues', *World Development* 27(3): 611-627.
- Erel, U. (2007) 'Constructing Meaningful Lives: Biographical Methods in Research on Migrant Women', *Sociological Research Online* 12(4): 5.
- Esposto, A (2008) 'Skill: An Elusive and Ambiguous Concept in Labor Market Studies', *Australian Bulletin of Labor* 34(1): 100.
- Figart, D.M. (1997) 'Gender as More than a Dummy Variable: Feminist Approaches to Discrimination', *Review of Social Economy* 55(1): 1-32.
- Ghorashi, H. and M. van Tilburg (2006) "'When is My Dutch Good enough?" Experiences of Refugee Women with Dutch Labor Organizations', *Journal of International Migration and Integration* 7(1): 51-70.
- Hamer, M.C. (2008) 'Migration Patterns and Influence of Support Networks: A Case Study of West Africans in the Netherlands', *Gender, Technology and Development* 12(3): 347-364.
- Hartog, J., 1946 and A. Zorlu (2008) *Employment Assimilation of Immigrants in the Netherlands*: Aslan Zorlu, Joop Hartog. Vol. TI 2008-057/3. Amsterdam [etc.]: Tinbergen Institute.
- Holman, D. (2000) 'A Dialogical Approach to Skill and Skilled Activity', *Human Relations* 53(7): 957-980.
- Huffman, M.L. and L. Torres (2001) 'Job Search Methods: Consequences for Gender-Based Earnings Inequality', *Journal of vocational behavior* 58(1): 127-141.
- Ibrahim, S. and S. Alkire (2007) 'Agency and Empowerment: A Proposal for Internationally Comparable Indicators Solava Ibrahim, University of Cam-

bridge, Cambridge, UK. Sabina Alkire, Un', *Oxford development studies* 35(4): 379-403.

- Instituut voor Toegepaste Sociale Wetenschappen (Nijmegen) (2000) *Five New Ethnic Groups in the Netherlands: A Comparative Analysis* / Institute of Applied Social Sciences, Catholic University Nijmegen. The Hague: Ministry of the Interior and Kingdom Relations, Minorities Integration Policy Department.
- Iredale, R. (2001) 'The Migration of Professionals: Theories and Typologies', *International Migration* 39(5): 7-26.
- James, O. (2010) *'Resilient Women: Migrant Women's Response to their Employment Experience in Ireland during Recessionary Times'*.
- Jenkins, S. (2004) *Gender, Place and the Labor Market*. London. Ashgate Pub Limited.
- Kabeer, N. (2009) *Women's Control over Economic Resources and Access to Financial Resources, Including Microfinance: 2009 World Survey on the Role of Women in Development*. UN.
- Kabeer, N. (2005) 'Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment: A Critical Analysis of the Third Millennium Development Goal 1', *Gender and Development* 13(1): 13-24.
- Knudsen, V.S. (2007), 'Intersectionality: A Theoretical Inspiration in the Analysis of Minority Cultures and Identities in Textbooks.
- Kofman, E. (2000) 'The Invisibility of Skilled Female Migrants and Gender Relations in Studies of Skilled Migration in Europe', *International Journal of Population Geography* 6(1): 45-59.
- Kofman, E. and P. Raghuram (2005) 'Gender and Skilled Migration: Into and Beyond the Work Place.', *Geoforum* 36(2): 149-15
- Korteweg, A.C. (2005) 'The Management of Gender Difference and Immigrant Integration Policy in the Netherlands'. Paper prepared for SSRC/UCI Summer Institute for Migration. Accessed on 15th April 2012
<<http://www.cri.uci.edu/pdf/Korteweg.pdf>.>
- Liversage, A. (2009) 'Vital Conjunctions, Shifting Horizons: High-Skilled Female Immigrants Looking for Work', *Work, Employment and Society* 23(1): 120-141.
- Makkonen, T. (2002) 'Multiple, Compound and Intersectional Discrimination: Bringing the Experiences of the most Marginalized to the Fore', Relatório de pesquisa elaborado para o Ministério de Assuntos Exteriores da Finlândia. Åbo Akademi Institute for Human Rights Research Reports 11.
- Man, G. (2004) 'Gender, work and migration: Deskilling Chinese immigrant women in Canada', *Women's Studies International Forum*, Elsevier pp135-148.
- McDowell, L. (2008) 'Thinking through Work: Complex Inequalities, Constructions of Difference and Trans-National Migrants', *Progress in Human Geography* 32(4): 491-507.

- McGovern, P. (2007) 'Immigration, Labor Markets and Employment Relations: Problems and Prospects', *British Journal of Industrial Relations* 45(2): 217-235.
- Meares, C. (2010) 'A fine balance: Women, work and skilled migration', *Women's Studies International Forum*, Elsevier pp473-481.
- Mohanty, C. (1998). *Under Western Eyes: Feminist Scholarship and Colonial*
- Morokvašić, M. (1984) 'Birds of Passage are also Women...', *International migration review* 18(4): 886-907.
- Narayan-Parker, D. (2005) *'Measuring Empowerment: Cross-Disciplinary Perspectives / Ed. by Deepa Narayan'. Washington, D.C: The World Bank.*
- Park, K. (2008) "‘I can Provide for My Children’: Korean Immigrant Women’s Changing Perspectives on Work Outside the Home", *Gender Issues* 25(1): 26-42.
- Parpart, J.L., S.M. Rai, K. Staudt, J. Parpart, S. Rai and K. Staudt (2002) *'Rethinking Em (Power) Ment, Gender and Development'*, *Rethinking empowerment: gender and development in a global/ local world* 3:1. Accessed on 22nd August 2012
<http://www.ethicsofempowerment.org/papers/RaiEmpowerment.pdf>
- Patton, M.Q. (1980) *Qualitative Evaluation Methods*. Sage publications Beverly Hills, CA.
- Purkayastha, B. (2005) 'Skilled Migration and Cumulative Disadvantage: The Case of Highly Qualified Asian Indian Immigrant Women in the US', *Geoforum* 36(2): 181-196.
- Riaño, Y. and N. Baghdadi (2007) 'Understanding the Labor Market Participation of Skilled Immigrant Women in Switzerland: The Interplay of Class, Ethnicity, and Gender', *Journal of International Migration and Integration* 8(2): 163-183.
- Roggeband, C. and M. Verloo (2007) 'Dutch Women are Liberated, Migrant Women are a Problem'. *The Evolution of Policy Frames on Gender and Migration in the Netherlands, 1995–2005*, *Social Policy and Administration* 41(3): 271-288.
- Samman, E. and M.E. Santos (2009) 'Agency and Empowerment: A Review of Concepts, Indicators and Empirical Evidence'.
- Sardenberg, C. (2008) *'Liberal Vs Liberating Empowerment: A Latin American Feminist Perspective on Conceptualizing Women’s Empowerment'*, *IDS Bulletin* 39(6): 18-27.
- Syed, J. (2010) *'Reconstructing gender empowerment'*, Elsevier pp283-294.
- Syed, J. (2008) 'Employment Prospects for Skilled Migrants: A Relational Perspective', *Human Resource Management Review* 18(1): 28- Esposito, A. (2008) 'Skill: An Elusive and Ambiguous Concept in Labor Market Studies', *Australian Bulletin of Labor* 34(1): 100.
- Van Laer, K. and M. Janssens (2011) *'Ethnic Minority Professionals’ Experiences with Subtle Discrimination in the Workplace'*, *human relations* 64(9): 1203-1227.

- Winker, G. and N. Degele (2011) '*Intersectionality as Multi-Level Analysis: Dealing with Social Inequality*', European Journal of Women's Studies 18(1): 51-66.
- Wren, K. and P. Boyle (2001) '*Migration and Work-Related Health in Europe*', National Institute for Working Life, Stockholm Accessed on 11th of September 2012
http://www.ekhist.uu.se/Saltsa/Saltsa_pdf/2002_10_Migr.pilot_Wren.pdf